|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  | |
| Book Name: | [Current Progress in Arts and Social Studies Research](https://www.bookpi.org/bookstore/product/current-progress-in-arts-and-social-studies-research-vol-1/) |
| Manuscript Number: | **Ms\_BPR\_2100** |
| Title of the Manuscript: | **AN INVESTIGATION MODEL TO COMBAT COMPUTER GAMING DELINQUENCY IN SOUTH AFRICA, SERVER-BASED GAMING, AND ILLEGAL ONLINE GAMING** |
| Type of the Article | **Book chapter** |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| PART 1: Review Comments | | |
| Compulsory REVISION comments | Reviewer’s comment | Author’s Feedback*(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimumof 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.** | The book's theoretical framework for examining illicit online gambling is not just a notable strength, but a significant contribution to the field. The model offers a comprehensive solution to a complicated problem by combining data-driven methods, financial and technological evaluations, and international collaboration. Due to the varied and changing nature of online gambling, a multifaceted strategy is necessary.  South Africa's inclusion provides significant background to the worldwide discourse on internet gambling. Similar to other nations, South Africa encounters distinct difficulties in this domain, such as [specific challenges], and customising the model to suit its particular requirements is a praiseworthy endeavour.  The focus on global cooperation is especially remarkable. Illicit internet gambling frequently transcends national boundaries, necessitating international collaboration as a vital component for successful enforcement. The book's strong endorsement of this partnership not only demonstrates an appreciation for the worldwide scope of the problem but also validates the audience's understanding of the issue. |  |
| **Is the title of the article suitable?**  **(If not please suggest an alternative title)** | Yes |  |
| Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here. | The abstract is suitable.  Consider rephrasing the last sentence in the abstract :  *“Conclusion by implementing a comprehensive investigation model and fostering international cooperation, stakeholders can significantly reduce the prevalence of illegal online gambling and create a safer online environment for all.”* |  |
| **Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?** | Yes overall it is.  The research questions address legal frameworks and enforcement strategies, however, the introduction could delve into how current legal structures in South Africa and internationally address illegal online gambling. A more detailed analysis of existing legal and enforcement gaps would clarify how the proposed model fits within the broader legal landscape, instilling confidence in its applicability.  The research objectives are clearly defined, and the text could benefit from a more detailed exploration of implementation strategies. For instance, how will the proposed investigation model be operationalized within existing law enforcement frameworks? More practical examples or case studies demonstrating the application of the model would enhance its practical utility.  The author should, however, consider to include discussion on the potential challenges and limitations of the proposed investigation model would provide a balanced view and prepare the audience for potential obstacles. |  |
| **Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimumof 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.** | The aim and objectives are clearly articulated and well-aligned with the problem statement. The focus on developing a comprehensive investigation model that integrates financial, technical, and human intelligence provides a well-rounded approach to tackling illegal online gambling.  The model’s significance is well-articulated, it is however crucial to provide more detailed implementation strategies. The integration of the model into existing law enforcement practices and policies is not just a step, but a necessity. Specific examples or case studies could provide practical insights into its application, making the process more understandable and manageable.  A more thorough evaluation of the model’s potential impact would benefit the study. How will the effectiveness of the proposed strategies be measured? It is crucial to establish a framework for assessing the model's success in real-world scenarios, as it would enhance its practical utility and make the text more engaging for the readers.  The study's significance and theoretical framework offer a strong foundation for developing an effective investigation model against illegal online gambling. The focus on protecting individuals, enhancing law enforcement capabilities, and informing policy is commendable. However, the study could benefit from more detailed implementation strategies, impact evaluation, and empirical support for the theoretical frameworks. The study can provide a more actionable and evidence-based approach to combating illegal online gambling by addressing these areas. |  |
| **Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.**  **-** | No- the references are limited, however, I must acknowledge that this is a very novel field of study.  Just some references and suggestions that the authors may want to peruse and evaluate if any are appropriate and applicable:  DeLisi, M., Vaughn, M.G., Gentile, D.A., Anderson, C.A. and Shook, J.J., 2013. Violent video games, delinquency, and youth violence: New evidence. *Youth Violence and Juvenile Justice*, *11*(2), pp.132-142.<https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/1541204012460874>  Smith, R., 2018. *Crime in the digital age: Controlling telecommunications and cyberspace illegalities*. Routledge. https://www.taylorfrancis.com/books/mono/10.4324/9780203794401/crime-digital-age-russell-smith  Kwon, H., Mohaisen, A., Woo, J., Kim, Y., Lee, E. and Kim, H.K., 2016. Crime scene reconstruction: Online gold farming network analysis. *IEEE Transactions on Information Forensics and Security*, *12*(3), pp.544-556.https://ieeexplore.ieee.org/abstract/document/7727944/  Atkinson, R. and Rodgers, T., 2016. Pleasure zones and murder boxes: Online pornography and violent video games as cultural zones of exception. *British journal of criminology*, *56*(6), pp.1291-1307. https://academic.oup.com/bjc/article-abstract/56/6/1291/2415118  Geldenhuys, K., 2017. The blue whale challenge-a dangerous online game with one intention: to kill. *Servamus Community-based Safety and Security Magazine*, *110*(12), pp.22-25. <https://journals.co.za/doi/abs/10.10520/EJC-b16ed22ab>  Van der Westhuizen, E. and Carnelley, M., 2023. Regulation of Video Gaming Loot Boxes: Lessons for South Africa from Abroad. *Potchefstroom Electronic Law Journal/PotchefstroomseElektronieseRegsblad*, *26*(1), pp.1-73. https://www.ajol.info/index.php/pelj/article/view/269390  Saarinen, T., 2017. *Toxic behavior in online games* (Master's thesis, T. Saarinen). https://oulurepo.oulu.fi/handle/10024/8796  Sakib, S.N., 2024. Contemporary Serial Killer: Web-Based Games in Social Media. https://www.preprints.org/manuscript/202403.0026  Kritzinger, E., 2017. Growing a cyber-safety culture amongst school learners in South Africa through gaming. *South African Computer Journal*, *29*(2), pp.16-35. https://journals.co.za/doi/abs/10.18489/sacj.v29i2.471  Mateus-Coelho, N. and Cruz-Cunha, M. eds., 2023. *Exploring cyber criminals and data privacy measures*. IGI Global. https://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=&id=kWnWEAAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq=COMBAT+COMPUTER+GAMING+DELINQUENCY+IN+SOUTH+AFRICA,+SERVER-BASED+GAMING,+AND+ILLEGAL+ONLINE+GAMING&ots=Q88xuHxuo\_&sig=U6blXSGsdG-rVU\_rofzGWXjcY08  Masogo, P., Board, L.G. and Modise, J.M., An Investigation Model to Combat Computer Gaming Delinquency in South Africa, Server-Based Gaming, and Illegal Online Gaming.  Masogo, M.P. and Mofokeng, J.T., 2018. An analysis on illegal online gambling activities: the comparative study within the Gauteng, North West and Limpopo Provinces. *International Journal of Social Sciences and Humanity Studies*, *10*(1), pp.33-48.  Zetterström, J., 2005. A legal analysis of cheating in online multiplayer games.  CARDOZO, B., Legal Issues Confronting Online Gaming Operators and Players. https://www.liebertpub.com/doi/pdf/10.1089/9781934854006.347  Lamb, C., Types of Gaming. *Rose, I. Nelson/Owens, Martin D.(Hrsg.), Internet Gaming Law*, *2*. <https://home.liebertpub.com/dcontent/files/samplechapters/Sample_InternetGamingLawSecondEditionRe.pdf>  Mann, B.L. ed., 2020. *Applying Internet Laws and Regulations to Educational Technology*. IGI Global.<https://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=&id=gkThDwAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PR1&dq=COMBAT+COMPUTER+GAMING+DELINQUENCY+IN+SOUTH+AFRICA,+SERVER-BASED+GAMING,+AND+ILLEGAL+ONLINE+GAMING&ots=TEMdpGuGyu&sig=erSkXm3axsmW4RWMjuRqsypOJhE>  Schwarze, J., 2014. Deviant Legality. <https://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/document?repid=rep1&type=pdf&doi=2f0dea33ca4664dcb52705c2ab147f66a2970c3d>  Adams, R., Gastrow, M., Oppelt, T.R.S., Rule, S.P., Mokhema, S. and Parker, S., 2020. Research to determine the potential impact of the fourth industrial revolution on the current and future regulation of gambling in South Africa. <https://repository.hsrc.ac.za/handle/20.500.11910/15237>  Shelley, W.R., 2013. End of the Chase: Using North Carolina as a Guide for Ending Other States' Video Sweepstakes Legislative Merry-Go-Round in the Wake of Hest Technologies v. North Carolina. *NC Cent. L. Rev.*, *36*, p.41. <https://heinonline.org/hol-cgi-bin/get_pdf.cgi?handle=hein.journals/ncclj36&section=6>  Reddy, E. and Lawack, V., 2019. An overview of the regulatory developments in South Africa regarding the use of cryptocurrencies. *SA Mercantile Law Journal*, *31*(1), pp.1-28. <https://journals.co.za/doi/abs/10.10520/EJC-1a76e8f6e1>  Candy, G., 2010. *Mapping gaming infrastructures* (Doctoral dissertation, Concordia University).<https://spectrum.library.concordia.ca/id/eprint/979219/>  Theophilopoulos, C., 2023. Cyber-warrant searches and the admissibility of seized smartphone data evidence at trial. *SACJ*, *195*, p.212. https://journals.co.za/doi/pdf/10.47348/SACJ/v36/i2a3  THEOPHILOPOULOS, C., data evidence at trial. *SACJ*, *195*, p.212.  <https://heinonline.org/hol-cgi-bin/get_pdf.cgi?handle=hein.journals/soafcrimj36&section=17>  Bikowski, K., 2020. *Not All Fun And Gaymes: Technology, Transgression, and Representation Among Gaymers* (Master's thesis, Louisiana State University and Agricultural & Mechanical College). https://search.proquest.com/openview/5d6358c8bf9f409a09e9611b57cf1a3f/1?pq-origsite=gscholar&cbl=18750&diss=y  Leslie, D.A. and Leslie, D.A., 2014. Prosecuting Cyberlaundering. *Legal Principles for Combatting Cyberlaundering*, pp.263-335. <https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007/978-3-319-06416-1_5>  JOURNALISTS, I. and ACTIVISTS, C., 2016. A qualitative analysis of how.https://www.mediaanddemocracy.com/uploads/1/6/5/7/16577624/duncan\_2\_comm\_surveillance.pdf  Bhardwaj, A., 2023. *New Age Cyber Threat Mitigation for Cloud Computing Networks*. Bentham Science Publishers.<https://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=&id=GarKEAAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP10&dq=COMBAT+COMPUTER+GAMING+DELINQUENCY+IN+SOUTH+AFRICA,+SERVER-BASED+GAMING,+AND+ILLEGAL+ONLINE+GAMING&ots=adS_1uYSbZ&sig=WMbsL5BDXsPP_cybkYe9ONLdX5w>  Cook, N., Ingalls, M.M. and Trippett, D. eds., 2019. *The Cambridge companion to music in digital culture*. Cambridge University Press.<https://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=&id=VtGoDwAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PR9&dq=COMBAT+COMPUTER+GAMING+DELINQUENCY+IN+SOUTH+AFRICA,+SERVER-BASED+GAMING,+AND+ILLEGAL+ONLINE+GAMING&ots=-UC4_HGnL1&sig=LihgU12x9DLiwOfi6oIjnKF6Les>  Mackett, D., 2021. *Epistemic Injustice and Data Mining*. University of Johannesburg (South Africa). https://search.proquest.com/openview/e71fb1711849ec5fa1f9e04a0d1eb5ee/1?pq-origsite=gscholar&cbl=2026366&diss=y  Exelmans, L., Custers, K. and Van den Bulck, J., 2015. Violent video games and delinquent behavior in adolescents: A risk factor perspective. *Aggressive behavior*, *41*(3), pp.267-279. https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/ab.21587  Seiffert, J. and Nothhaft, H., 2015. The missing media: The procedural rhetoric of computer games. *Public Relations Review*, *41*(2), pp.254-263.  https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0363811114001830  József, S., 2022. Digital Terrorism: Communication through Online Video Games. *HadtudományiSzemle*, *15*(3), pp.183-195. https://folyoirat.ludovika.hu/index.php/hsz/article/view/6169 |  |
| Minor REVISION commentsIs the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications? | Yes, minor language editing can be considered. |  |
| Optional/Generalcomments | The discussion on the unique regulatory environment in South Africa, driven by the National Gambling Act, is insightful. It acknowledges the need for a tailored approach due to the country's specific legal and technological challenges. This localized focus adds significant value, as it recognizes that solutions effective in other regions may be outside the realm of possibility in South Africa.  The book correctly points out the dynamic nature of the technology used by illegal gambling organizations. This awareness underscores the need for a model that is both adaptable and responsive, which is crucial for staying ahead of evolving threats in the online gambling landscape.  Consideration may be given to more detailed exploration objectives of implementation strategies. For instance, how will the proposed investigation model be operationalized within existing law enforcement frameworks? More practical examples or case studies demonstrating the model's application would enhance its practical utility.  The book mentions various investigative techniques, such as financial forensics, network analysis, and undercover operations, but it lacks detailed methodologies or best practices for these approaches. Deeper insights into the execution of these techniques would offer greater value to practitioners in the field..  The introduction and background sections of the book establish a solid basis for the proposed investigation model, highlighting the need for a dynamic and comprehensive approach to illegal online gambling in South Africa.  The contextual relevance and technological awareness are commendable, providing a solid foundation for the research. However, the book could benefit from more detailed implementation strategies, operational insights, and a thorough analysis of existing legal frameworks. The book could offer a more actionable and contextually grounded resource for law enforcement and policymakers tackling illegal online gambling by addressing these areas.  The theoretical model is robust, the book may benefit from more practical guidance on implementation.  For instance, how should law enforcement agencies in South Africa integrate this model into their existing frameworks?  Specific case studies or pilot programs demonstrating the model in action could enhance its practical value.  Herewith specific comments that should be considered:  **Proactive Measures**  **Data Gathering and Analysis:**  Consider specifying the types of unusual traffic patterns that should be monitored. This could include sudden spikes in traffic, unusual user behaviour, or patterns that deviate from the norm. By defining what constitutes 'unusual', it becomes easier to correlate these patterns with known illegal gambling activities.  Elaborate on the use of web crawlers. These tools can be programmed to search for specific terms or phrases that might indicate illegal gambling websites. By detailing the specific terms or phrases that could be used as indicators, it becomes easier to identify and block these sites.  **Public Awareness:**  Consider including strategies for public awareness campaigns. These campaigns, when disseminated effectively, will keep the public informed and involved in the fight against illegal online gambling.  **Reactive Measures - Investigation Process**  **Complaint Intake and Assessment:**  Consider detailing the criteria for the risk assessment framework. This could include factors such as the nature of the complaint, the potential harm it could cause, and the likelihood of it occurring. By providing a clear set of criteria, it becomes easier to determine the severity and potential harm of complaints.  **Investigation:**  For financial investigations, consider specifying the types of transactions or financial indicators that might reveal illicit activities. Examples could include large, frequent cash deposits or withdrawals.  Consider, to expand the technical investigation section by describing specific tools or methodologies for analysing website traffic and IP addresses.  Consider adding potential challenges and solutions when working with informants or conducting undercover operations in the human intelligence section.  **Evidence Collection and Preservation:**  Consider emphasising the importance of maintaining a chain of custody for digital evidence and the potential legal ramifications if this is not done correctly.  It might be helpful to provide examples of how evidence has been successfully preserved and used in similar cases.  **Enforcement and Prevention**  **Legal Action:**  Consider including potential legal challenges or limitations when prosecuting illegal online gambling cases—for example, jurisdictional issues or difficulties in proving the legality of the gambling operations.  **Site Blocking:**  Consider Elaborating on the technical and legal challenges of site blocking, such as illegal operators using proxy servers or mirror sites to circumvent blocking efforts.  **International Cooperation**  **Forming Alliances:**  Consider describing specific examples of successful international cooperation in combating similar types of cybercrime. How can these examples be applied to the context of illegal online gambling?  **Investigation of Crime and Investigator's Role**  **Role of Investigators:**  Consider including more detail on the investigator's approach to digital evidence. How do they ensure the reliability and admissibility of this evidence in court?  **Physical Evidence:**  Consider providing examples of physical evidence that might be particularly relevant in online gambling investigations, such as hardware used in illegal operations or digital storage devices.  **Activities Involved in Illegal Online Gambling**  **Modus Operandi:**  The description of illegal online gambling operations is detailed. It might be useful to compare them with legal gambling operations to highlight the differences and aid in the identification of illegal activities.  **Projected Investigation Model**  **Existing Models:**  Consider to briefly summarize the strengths and weaknesses of the existing investigative models. How does the CIM model address these weaknesses?  **Proactive Investigations:**  Consider Including specific examples or case studies where proactive investigations have effectively combat cybercrime.  **Role of SAPS and National Gambling Board**  **SAPS Responsibilities:**  Consider to provide recommendations for improving the SAPS's focus on illegal online gambling. This could include specialised training or the development of dedicated units.  **National Gambling Board:**  Consider explaining how the National Gambling Board can collaborate with other entities, like financial institutions or tech companies, to enhance enforcement and monitoring efforts.  **Functions and Powers**  **Compliance Inspectors:**  Consider to detail any limitations or challenges faced by compliance inspectors in enforcing regulations. For instance, how do they handle non-cooperative or evasive operators?  **Law Enforcement Inspectors:**  Consider to describe any recent legal changes or updates that impact the powers and functions of law enforcement inspectors.  Additional considerations should include the following to improve the rigour and clarity of the study chapter:  **Quantitative Data/ Empirical data/ Anecdotal evidence**:  **Consider to p**rovide specific figures or statistics about the impact on legitimate businesses. For instance, how has the reduction in workforce and financial losses translated into broader economic implications such as unemployment rates or regional economic decline?  **Consider to** incorporate statistics on the prevalence of gambling addiction and its social consequences. Data on the number of affected individuals or communities could strengthen the argument.  Include empirical evidence supporting the theory of gambling exposure and accessibility. This could involve citing studies or statistics that demonstrate the relationship between accessibility and gambling-related harms.  Include anecdotal evidence or case studies of individuals who have benefited from the NRGP's treatment services. This adds a personal touch to the data.  Consider to include data on the effectiveness of the NRGP's initiatives. For instance, what percentage of individuals treated for gambling addiction report improved outcomes?  **Policy Implications**:  Consider to discuss potential policy recommendations or measures to mitigate the economic impact. For instance, how could regulation or enforcement be improved?  Based on the theory, propose policy recommendations to address gambling exposure and accessibility. How can regulations be adjusted to mitigate harm?  Overall, the study is thorough and provides a well-rounded picture of the impact of illegal online gambling in South Africa. These suggestions aim to refine and enrich the analysis, making it more compelling and informative. |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **PART 2:** | | |
|  | **Reviewer’s comment** | **Author’s comment***(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?** | *(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)* |  |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Reviewer Details:** | |
| Name: | **Joe H Smith** |
| Department, University & Country | **College of Law, School of Criminal Justice, University of South Africa, South Africa** |