|  |
| --- |
|  |
| Book Name: | [An Overview of Literature, Language and Education Research](https://www.bookpi.org/bookstore/product/an-overview-of-literature-language-and-education-research-vol-1/) |
| Manuscript Number: | **Ms\_BPR\_** **3091** |
| Title of the Manuscript:  | **Evaluation of Policy-based Initiatives' Impact on Indian Tribal Populations: Current Circumstances and Potential for Development** |
| Type of the Article | **Book chapter** |

|  |
| --- |
| PART 1: Review Comments |
| Compulsory REVISION comments | Reviewer’s comment | Author’s Feedback *(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.** | This manuscript is of great importance to the scientific community as it offers a comprehensive analysis of the socio-economic and health challenges faced by India's tribal populations. By detailing the historical and contemporary governmental efforts, it highlights the persistent disparities between tribal and non-tribal populations, making a case for more targeted policies. I appreciate the manuscript's breadth, covering various critical areas like healthcare, education, and traditional practices, as well as its use of statistical data to underline the urgency of addressing tribal malnutrition and health crises. The manuscript's exploration of tribal health issues, alongside education schemes and government initiatives, is particularly valuable in encouraging more research and policy discourse in these areas. |  |
| **Is the title of the article suitable?****(If not please suggest an alternative title)** | The current title is clear but could be more concise and engaging. The alternative title: "Assessing Policy Impacts on Indian Tribal Communities: Challenges, Progress, and Future Opportunities" |  |
| Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here. | Below are some suggestions to enhance the comprehensiveness of the abstract:1. Organization:* Group the issues more clearly under health and education for better coherence.
* Separate problems, initiatives, and outcomes clearly, allowing the reader to follow the flow.

2. Simplify Language:* Shorten long sentences to avoid overwhelming the reader with too much information at once.
* Clarify key points regarding the impact and effectiveness of the policies.

3. Suggestions for Additions:* Add a brief mention of how these issues affect socio-economic mobility and cultural preservation, as these are often tied to health and education in tribal contexts.
* Include a line or two on the need for improving policy implementation, especially around monitoring and community involvement.

4. Suggestions for Deletions/Modifications:* Some detailed listings (e.g., the portals and schemes) could be shortened or synthesized to keep the abstract concise.
* Instead of just listing schemes, provide a sense of their impact or challenges in execution.

Revised Abstract:"Tribal communities in India continue to face significant challenges in health and education due to anomalies and complications at various levels of policymaking, planning, and implementation. Issues within the educational and healthcare systems—including content, curriculum, pedagogy, and inadequate monitoring—are compounded by socio-economic and cultural barriers. To address these, various governmental initiatives have been launched, such as the Pre-Matric and Post-Matric Scholarship Schemes, National and International scholarships, and the National Tribal Health Portal. However, despite these efforts, the benefits have only recently started reaching tribal populations, largely hindered by a lack of awareness, administrative disinterest, and the unique socio-cultural dynamics of these communities. The abstract reviews these challenges and the potential for development through improved policy implementation and outreach." |  |
| **Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?** | The subsections and structure of the manuscript are appropriate in covering key areas such as education, healthcare, and policy impacts on tribal populations. However, a clearer distinction between problems, interventions, and outcomes could enhance readability and analytical depth. |  |
| **Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.** | The manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound as it provides a thorough evaluation of the challenges faced by tribal populations in India, supported by evidence from policy interventions and programs. It addresses a wide range of variables, including socio-economic and cultural barriers, and highlights specific government initiatives in health and education. The inclusion of national schemes and detailed analysis of their implementation strengthens its empirical foundation, making the research relevant and grounded in real-world data.  |  |
| **Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.****-** | The references listed are comprehensive and include a mix of recent sources (2021-2024) and some older, foundational works. However, the inclusion of more recent studies, particularly empirical research and policy evaluations from the past three to five years, could strengthen the manuscript's relevance. This is particularly important for keeping up with evolving policy impacts and the current socio-economic conditions of tribal populations in India.Some suggestions for additional references include:* More recent empirical studies or policy reviews on tribal education and health outcomes.
* Research on the effectiveness of specific government schemes, such as the outcomes of the Tribal Sub-Plan or similar welfare programs.
* Articles or reports that specifically address the intersectionality of tribal issues with gender or environmental factors.

These additions could provide more up-to-date insights and support a deeper analysis of the current challenges and progress related to tribal populations. |  |
| Minor REVISION commentsIs the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications? | Satisfactory |  |
| Optional/General comments | Grammatical errors have been corrected and the changes made were marked in bold letter by the reviewer. |  |

|  |
| --- |
| **PART 2:**  |
|  | **Reviewer’s comment** | **Author’s comment** *(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?**  | *(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)* |  |

|  |
| --- |
| Reviewer Details: |
| Name: | **Surjya Narayan Tripathy** |
| Department, University & Country | **Gokhale institute of Politics & Economics, India** |