|  |
| --- |
|  |
| Book Name: | **Proceedings of the 8th International Conference on Solidification and Gravity** |
| Manuscript Number: | **Ms\_BPR\_3590.6** |
| Title of the Manuscript:  | **Phase-field simulation of SEEDs as nucleation sites in Ti-6Al-4V for electrostatic levitation experiments** |
| Type of the Article | **BOOK CHAPTER** |

|  |
| --- |
| PART 1: Review Comments |
| Compulsory REVISION comments | Reviewer’s comment | Author’s Feedback*(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimumof 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.** | ***This manuscript is well written and well organized.*** ***The work is very interesting and easy to understand.******The paper provides new scientific results to the scientific community.*** |  |
| **Is the title of the article suitable?****(If not please suggest an alternative title)** | ***The title of the paper is suitable.*** |  |
| Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here. | ***The abstract of the paper is comprehensive.*** ***I suggest that the authors more clearly emphasis their work in the abstract.***  |  |
| **Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?** | ***The subsections and structure of the manuscript are appropriate.*** |  |
| **Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimumof 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.** | ***- The English language should be revised.******- The references should be updated in the introduction.******- I recommend that the authors enrich the sections by adding recent references.*** ***- The discussion should be improved. For example, the interpretation of Figure 8 is missing. Also, the authors should place the results in context by comparing them with the literature.******- Measurement errors are missing.******- Table 1: you must add a title of each column (Properties - Value).******- The legend of figure 7 ( indicating what A, B, C, D, E and F) is misssing.******- Explain how you graduated the x-axis of Figure 7.******- Page 57: “...using the commercially available phase field simulation software MICRESS®”. Please add the reference: (Access e.V. Aachen, Germany) [ref].******- The last paragraph in page 63( please do not alter...paragraph) should be deleted.*** ***- Page 63: while NPF\_fin decreases as the value of V increases, NPF\_fin, increases as the value of V decreases: Explain why.*** ***- The conclusion should be rewritten.***  |  |
| **Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.** | ***The references should be updated.***  |  |
| Minor REVISION commentsIs the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications? | ***The language/English quality of the paper must be revised.***  |  |
| Optional/General comments |  |  |

|  |
| --- |
| **PART 2:**  |
|  | **Reviewer’s comment** | **Author’s comment** *(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?**  | *(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)* |  |

|  |
| --- |
| **Reviewer Details:** |
| Name: | **Mohsen Mhadhbi** |
| Department, University & Country | **National Institute of Research and Physicochemical Analysis, Tunisia** |