|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  | |
| Book Name: | [**Geography, Earth Science and Environment: Research Highlights**](https://www.bookpi.org/bookstore/product/geography-earth-science-and-environment-research-highlights-vol-1/) |
| Manuscript Number: | **Ms\_BPR\_4614** |
| Title of the Manuscript: | **Water Quality and Trophic State of Kaw Lake** |
| Type of the Article | **Book Chapter** |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| PART 1: Comments | | |
|  | Reviewer’s comment **Artificial Intelligence (AI) generated or assisted review comments are strictly prohibited during peer review.** | Author’s Feedback *(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.** | **This article discusses the analysis of water quality in Kaw Lake using the Carlson Trophic State Index (TSI) by measuring transparency, chlorophyll-a, total nitrogen, and total phosphorus levels. Kaw Lake serves as a source for water supply, recreation, electricity, and wildlife conservation. Eutrophication can disrupt the lake's ecosystem due to high nutrient levels, reduced transparency, and decreased oxygen levels. The importance of this article lies in its aim to provide recommendations to managers and policymakers to slow down or halt eutrophication through the implementation of best management practices in soil and water conservation.** |  |
| **Is the title of the article suitable?**  **(If not please suggest an alternative title)** | **No. The title of this article is "Water Quality and Trophic State of Kaw Lake" but the water quality analyzed in this article is only chlorophyll-a, phosphorus and nitrogen (nutrients) and does not analyze other water qualities. If you only want to focus on determining the level of eutrophication based on secchi disk depth transparency, phosphorus levels and nitrogen levels, maybe the title can be changed to "Eutrophication Assessment Based on Secchi Disk Depth Transparency and Nutrients in the Lake"** |  |
| Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here. | **Yes.** |  |
| **Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.** | **Yes.** |  |
| **Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.**  **-** | **1. Schindler, D. W., Carpenter, S. R., Chapra, S. C., Hecky, R. E., & Orihel, D. M. (2016). Reducing phosphorus to curb lake eutrophication is a success. *Environmental science & technology*, *50*(17), 8923-8929.**  **2. Dodds, W. K., & Smith, V. H. (2016). Nitrogen, phosphorus, and eutrophication in streams. *Inland Waters*, *6*(2), 155-164.** |  |
| Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications? | **Yes.** |  |
| Optional/General comments | **If the article intends to analyze water quality in Kaw Lake, it should also include other water quality parameters affected by eutrophication, such as temperature, dissolved oxygen (DO), and pH. If not, maybe this article can change the title.** |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **PART 2:** | | |
|  | **Reviewer’s comment** | **Author’s comment** *(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?** | *(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)* |  |

**Reviewer Details:**

**Yudi Nurul Ihsan, Universitas Padjadjaran, Indonesia**