|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  | |
| Book Name: | [**Geography, Earth Science and Environment: Research Highlights**](https://www.bookpi.org/bookstore/product/geography-earth-science-and-environment-research-highlights-vol-1/) |
| Manuscript Number: | **Ms\_BPR\_5080** |
| Title of the Manuscript: | **Heavy metal soil contamination in cocoa plantations in South West Region, Cameroon** |
| Type of the Article | **Book chapter** |

**Special note:**

**A research paper already published in a journal can be published as a Book Chapter in an expanded form with proper copyright approval.**

**Source Article:**

**This chapter is an extended version of the article published by the same author(s) in the following journal.**

**Journal of Ecology and The Natural Environment, 12 (3): 95-103, 2020.**

**DOI: 10.5897/JENE2020.0828**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| PART 1: Comments | | |
|  | Reviewer’s comment **Artificial Intelligence (AI) generated or assisted review comments are strictly prohibited during peer review.** | Author’s Feedback *(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.** | 1. Grain size analysis is closely correlated with HV concentration in soil. Please provide the classifications for the mesh size of clay, silt, and sand.  2. Fertilizers contain significant amounts of Cu and Zn as micronutrients, which can accumulate in the soil over long-term agricultural activities in crop areas. Kindly review the literature presented in the introduction section.  3. What is the background values for Igeo analysis, kindly mentioned or citations. What are the background values used for the Igeo analysis? Kindly provide the relevant values or appropriate citations.  4. The soil composite samples did not indicate the sampling periods. Why did not the author use grab sampling? |  |
| **Is the title of the article suitable?**  **(If not please suggest an alternative title)** | The article focuses on the use of an environmental index to assess HV contamination based on specific contamination criteria. Therefore, the title should reflect all relevant indices.  **Alternative title:**  An assessment of selected heavy metals contamination in aricultural soils of *Erythroxylum coca* plantations at South West Region, Cameroon |  |
| Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here. | The full name of CEC or ISQC is required upon first mention. |  |
| **Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.** | There are several physicochemical indicators and HV contamination indices; however, the methods section did not provide detailed on the statistical analysis. |  |
| **Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.** | 1. Many references are not updated, exceeding 20 years (e.g., Merrington et al. 2002; Gaw et al. 2003; Savithri et al., 2003; for Introduction and Teusch et al., 1999 for discussion). The introduction and discussion sections should be revised to incorporate a critical review with updated data, supported by current citations.  2. Some reference lists display the abbreviated form of journal names, while others provide the full name. Kindly verify the corrections with the highlighted yellow. |  |
| Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications? | The English grammar is satisfactory and appropriately presented. |  |
| Optional/General comments | 1. Kindly check the correction of certain physicochemical indices, such as N and P, which were not mentioned in the objectives and the abstract but appeared in the sections of method and result.  2. Table 3 does not display the concentration unit for HV. |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **PART 2:** | | |
|  | Reviewer’s comment | Author’s comment *(if agreed with the reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?** | *(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in detail)*  . |  |

**Reviewer details:**

**Jakkapan Potipat, Rambhai Barni Rajabhat University, Thailand**