|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  | |
| Book Name: | [**Physical Science: New Insights and Developments**](https://bookstore.bookpi.org/product/physical-science-new-insights-and-developments-vol-1/) |
| Manuscript Number: | **Ms\_BPR\_5186** |
| Title of the Manuscript: | **Prismatine granulite from Waldheim/Saxony: Zircon-Reidite** |
| Type of the Article | **Book Chapter** |

**Special note:**

**A research paper already published in a journal can be published as a Book Chapter in an expanded form with proper copyright approval.**

**Source Article:**

**This chapter is an extended version of the article published by the same author(s) in the following journal.**

**Journal of Earth & Environment Science, 1(2): 103, 2022.**

**Available:** [**https://www.cmjpublishers.com/volume-1-issue-2-earth/**](https://www.cmjpublishers.com/volume-1-issue-2-earth/)

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| PART 1: Comments | | |
|  | Reviewer’s comment **Artificial Intelligence (AI) generated or assisted review comments are strictly prohibited during peer review.** | Author’s Feedback *(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.** | **This study reports the first occurrence of metamorphic reidite in a prismantine-bearing granulite from Waldheim, Saxony. The metamorphic origin of this mineral has important bearings in terms of the *P-T* conditions of the rock and overall tectono-thermal evolution of this region. This is an important contribution from the mineralogical as well as geothermobarometric view points.** |  |
| **Is the title of the article suitable?**  **(If not please suggest an alternative title)** | **In my opinion, the title of the article should be modified as follows to better reflect the nature and uniqueness of the study:**  **“First reported occurrence of metamorphic reidite inclusions in zircon from prismantine-bearing granulite in Waldheim, Saxony: implications for tectono-thermal evolution” The present title is also misleading as its subject is the prismantine-bearing rock, and its relation with zircon/reidite is unclear.** |  |
| Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here. | **The abstract of the article is comprehensive and effectively sums up the essence of the study. However, a line or two about the findings of reidite based on specific bands on Raman spectra may be included for further clarity.** |  |
| **Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.** | **The manuscript appears to be scientifically correct, well-supported by suitable evidence and supporting citations.** |  |
| **Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.**  **-** | **The references range from old to new, with the older publications mostly dealing with reporting of the deposit, whereas the more recent publications have been used as supporting evidence for the experimental procedures.** |  |
| Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications? | **The overall language of the manuscript can be improved significantly for better flow and clarity. For example,** Such finding sheds new light on the origin of boron in the Bohemian Massif.  **Also, the use of proper scientific terminology in several places is missing. For example,**  “reidite and monoclinic ZrO2 in zircon give clear hints that such phases arrived very rapidly from great depths to shallower crustal levels (90 km) via supercritical fluid/melt”  **These aspects should be improved upon.** |  |
| Optional/General comments | **The authors may consider elaborating the discussion section further, and elucidating the mechanism of rapid emplacement as proposed in this article. The HP-HT granulite facies metamorphism occurred in response to which tectonic event may also be specified. The “rapid emplacement” mechanism appears akin to the mechanism of emplacement of kimberlites and presence of diamond inclusions in them which come from great depths. Can such a parallel be drawn for these rocks? However, kimberlite melts have an igneous origin and the diamond inclusions are inherited from the country rock at depth. Here, what would explain the rapid emplacement of a granulite? These aspects may be dwelled on further to make the implication more robust.** |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **PART 2:** | | |
|  | Reviewer’s comment | Author’s comment *(if agreed with the reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?** | *(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in detail)* |  |

**Reviewer details:**

**Anwesa Banerjee, India**