|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  | |
| Book Name: | [**Physical Science: New Insights and Developments**](https://bookstore.bookpi.org/product/physical-science-new-insights-and-developments-vol-1/) |
| Manuscript Number: | **Ms\_BPR\_5186** |
| Title of the Manuscript: | **Prismatine granulite from Waldheim/Saxony: Zircon-Reidite** |
| Type of the Article | **Book Chapter** |

**Special note:**

**A research paper already published in a journal can be published as a Book Chapter in an expanded form with proper copyright approval.**

**Source Article:**

**This chapter is an extended version of the article published by the same author(s) in the following journal.**

**Journal of Earth & Environment Science, 1(2): 103, 2022.**

**Available:** [**https://www.cmjpublishers.com/volume-1-issue-2-earth/**](https://www.cmjpublishers.com/volume-1-issue-2-earth/)

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| PART 1: Comments | | |
|  | Reviewer’s comment **Artificial Intelligence (AI) generated or assisted review comments are strictly prohibited during peer review.** | Author’s Feedback *(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.** | This manuscript is significant for a new finding of reidite in prismatine granulites from Waldheim/Saxony. This finding reports occurrence of reidite in a non-impact metamorphic setting.The study shows new perspectives on high-pressure mineral transformations in deep crustal rocks. |  |
| **Is the title of the article suitable?**  **(If not please suggest an alternative title)** | Suggested title: Prismatine granulite from Waldheim/Saxony: Zircon-Reidite Transformation |  |
| Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here. | The abstract needs some minor refinement to highlight better the new finding of the reidite and its geological implications. |  |
| **Is the manuscript scientifically correct? Please write here.** | This manuscript is validated scientifically, but requires some petrographic, textural, and mineralogical context of prismatine granulite. Also, the ZrO₂ crystallized from a supercritical fluid is speculative. Please, add some petrographic evidence. |  |
| **Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.**  **-** | The references are mostly appropriate, but adding some more references on reidite would be beneficial. |  |
| Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications? | No. The manuscript contains misspellings like “Such finding sheet”→"Such findings shed” “occurance” → “occurrence”, “The zircon grains shows”→ The zircon grains show, "Prismatine granulite contians high ammount of Boron."→ "Prismatine granulite contains a high amount of Boron.", “decomression” → “decompression”, "This results are inconsistent with previous studies." → "These results are inconsistent with previous studies.""More evidences are required to support the hypotesis."→"More evidence is required to support the hypothesis." |  |
| Optional/General comments | * Please write some geological setting on the Waldheim/Saxony area, including regional metamorphic history. * Improve the section headings, such as adding “Geological Setting,” “Sampling and Analytical Techniques,” “Results,” and “Discussion and Conclusions”. |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **PART 2:** | | |
|  | Reviewer’s comment | Author’s comment *(if agreed with the reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?** | *(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in detail)* |  |

**Reviewer details:**

**Vikas Pandey, India**