|  |
| --- |
|  |
| Book Name: | [**New Horizons of Science, Technology and Culture**](https://bookstore.bookpi.org/product/new-horizons-of-science-technology-and-culture-vol-1/) |
| Manuscript Number: | **Ms\_BPR\_5600** |
| Title of the Manuscript:  | **Safety analysis of sea border transportation in indonesia, case study : countries between countries in sumatera (batam – singapore and batam – johor)** |
| Type of the Article | **Book Chapter** |

**Special note:**

**A research paper already published in a journal can be published as a Book Chapter in an expanded form with proper copyright approval.**

**Source Article:**

**This chapter is an extended version of the article published by the same author(s) in the following journal.**

**MATEC Web of Conferences, 177, 01005 (2018)**

**DOI:** [**https://doi.org/10.1051/matecconf/201817701005**](https://doi.org/10.1051/matecconf/201817701005)

|  |
| --- |
| PART 1: Comments |
|  | Reviewer’s comment**Artificial Intelligence (AI) generated or assisted review comments are strictly prohibited during peer review.** | Author’s Feedback *(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.** | **The manuscript presents a case study analyzing the safety of sea border transportation between Batam (Indonesia), Singapore, and Johor (Malaysia). It includes observational findings about ferry terminals, vessel types, and safety equipment.** |  |
| **Is the title of the article suitable?****(If not please suggest an alternative title)** | **The title is generally relevant but could be more specific, concise, and academic. It mentions the broad topic but doesn't clearly reflect the case study focus or ASEAN connectivity context, which are central to the chapter. Suggestion title if the focus is on safety and specific routes:****"Safety Analysis of Cross-Border Ferry Transportation: A Case Study of Batam–Singapore and Batam–Johor Routes"** |  |
| Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here. | **Overall the abstract was unclear and grammatically incorrect sentences hinder understanding. There were lacks a sharp research question or objective. Some findings were implicitly mentioned; not clearly separated or summarized. The significance of study was broader context (ASEAN integration) is mentioned but underdeveloped. Suggestion to add in the abstract:-**1. **Clear research aim/question (e.g., evaluating safety compliance).**
2. **Brief methodology description (e.g., observational case study of ferry routes).**
3. **Concise findings (e.g., schedule efficiency, safety equipment compliance).**
4. **Implications (e.g., recommendations for safety and connectivity improvement).**
 |  |
| **Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.**  | **The main idea of the manuscript—evaluating the safety of sea border transportation between Batam, Singapore, and Johor—is scientifically sound and relevant within the fields of:**1. **Transport safety analysis**
2. **Maritime infrastructure assessment**
3. **Regional economic integration (ASEAN context)**

**However, several issues impact the clarity of the work.** |  |
| **Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.****-** | **Inconsistent referencing. Several facts and standards are mentioned without citation (e.g., technical definitions of ferry types, SOLAS requirements). The references quit good but can be include with the recent years.** **1. Maritime Safety Standards****International Maritime Organization (IMO). SOLAS Consolidated Edition 2020.****→ Provides the global benchmark for ship safety equipment and procedures.****2. Port Infrastructure and Safety Studies****Chhetri, P., et al. (2014). Seaport Infrastructure and Economic Growth: Evidence from Panel Data. Maritime Policy & Management, 41(6), 589–603.****→ Supports discussion on port infrastructure and economic impact.****3. Case-Specific or Comparable Studies****Mulyono, A.T. et al. (2021). Assessment of Port Service Quality and Passenger Satisfaction in Indonesian Ferry Terminals. Journal of Maritime Research.****→ Empirical study from Indonesia, directly relevant.** |  |
| Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications? | **The manuscript has numerous grammatical issues that obscure meaning. For example:****Original: "Batam located in locations strategic considering in the sea border area..."****Revised: "Batam is strategically located in a sea border area..."****Key grammar issues:****Incorrect verb forms (e.g., “has ordered well” should be “is well-organized”)****Article usage (“the Batam” vs. “Batam”)****Redundancies (“between countries between countries”)****Sentence fragments** |  |
| Optional/General comments | **The strength of the manuscripts as below:-** **Relevant Topic: The focus on ASEAN connectivity and maritime transport safety is significant for regional integration and policy development.****Empirical Observation: The chapter benefits from firsthand observation and includes illustrative photos and site-specific details.****Coverage of Infrastructure: Provides clear descriptions of ferry terminals and their role in inter-country transport.** |  |

|  |
| --- |
| **PART 2:**  |
|  | Reviewer’s comment | Author’s comment *(if agreed with the reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?**  |  |  |

**Reviewer details:**

**Mohd Shafeeq Bin Mohd Shafeeq, Malaysia**