|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  | |
| Book Name: | **"THE EVOLVING BLUEPRINT, STRATEGIC LEADERSHIP, VALUE-DRIVEN POLICE LEADERS AND ETHICAL EXCELLENCE IN LAW ENFORCEMENT"** |
| Manuscript Number: | **Ms\_BPR\_5036.2** |
| Title of the Manuscript: | **INEFFECTIVE LEADERS ARE UNABLE TO CARRY OUT LEADERSHIP ACTIONS SUCCESSFULLY AND EXHIBIT INCOMPATIBLE LEADERSHIP TRAITS** |
| Type of the Article | **Book Chapter** |

**Special note:**

**A research paper already published in a journal can be published as a Book Chapter in an expanded form with proper copyright approval.**

**Source Article:**

**This chapter is an extended version of the article published by the same author(s) in the following journal.**

**International Journal of Innovative Science and Research Technology, 8(8): 3005-3019, 2023.**

**DOI :** [**https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.10147196**](https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.10147196)

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| PART 1: Comments | | |
|  | Reviewer’s comment **Artificial Intelligence (AI) generated or assisted review comments are strictly prohibited during peer review.** | Author’s Feedback *(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.** | This manuscript makes a significant contribution to the literature on leadership by thoroughly examining the concept of toxic leadership and its detrimental effects on both individuals and organizations. The comprehensive exploration of various dimensions of negative leadership (toxic, destructive, narcissistic, abusive supervision) provides valuable insights for researchers and practitioners in the field of police leadership and management. The work is particularly relevant as it highlights the organizational consequences of toxic leadership behaviors, which can inform policy development and leadership training programs in law enforcement agencies. By consolidating multiple perspectives on ineffective leadership, the manuscript creates a foundation for future research on leadership assessment and intervention strategies. |  |
| **Is the title of the article suitable?**  **(If not please suggest an alternative title)** | The title is generally suitable, though somewhat lengthy. It clearly indicates the main focus of the manuscript on ineffective leadership. However, it could be more concise and specific. A suggestion would be: "INEFFECTIVE LEADERSHIP: EXAMINING TOXIC BEHAVIORS, TRAITS, AND THEIR ORGANIZATIONAL IMPACT IN LAW ENFORCEMENT." |  |
| Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here. | The abstract provides a good overview of the manuscript's content, covering the main themes of toxic leadership and its effects. However, it could be better structured to more clearly delineate the research purpose, methodology, key findings, and implications. The abstract would benefit from being more concise with fewer repetitive statements (e.g., multiple references to the negative impacts of toxic leadership) and a clearer indication of the chapter's unique contribution to the field of police leadership. Additionally, a stronger conclusion that emphasizes practical implications for leadership development in law enforcement would strengthen this section. |  |
| **Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.** | The manuscript demonstrates scientific soundness through its comprehensive literature review and theoretical framework. The author has thoroughly explored various perspectives on toxic leadership, drawing from established research in the field. However, the manuscript would benefit from a more explicit methodology section to clarify how the literature was selected and analyzed. While the content is generally scientifically correct, some claims could be strengthened with more recent empirical evidence, particularly in the sections on preventing toxic leadership and practical interventions. |  |
| **Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.**  **-** | The manuscript includes numerous references that cover the topic extensively. However, many of the citations appear to be from earlier decades (1990s-2010s), and the manuscript would benefit from incorporating more recent research published in the last five years (2020-2025) to ensure the most current perspectives are included. Additionally, the reference format appears inconsistent in places, with some citations including page numbers while others do not. The reference section should be standardized according to an appropriate academic style guide. Some suggested additional references could include recent studies on toxic leadership in virtual environments and contemporary approaches to leadership assessment in law enforcement. |  |
| Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications? | The manuscript generally demonstrates adequate language quality, but there are several areas that require improvement for scholarly communication:   1. There are grammatical inconsistencies throughout the text, including subject-verb agreement issues and run-on sentences. 2. Some paragraphs are excessively long and could be divided for better readability. 3. There is occasional repetition of content across different sections. 4. Some technical terms are used without clear definition. 5. The transitions between some sections are abrupt and could be smoothed for better flow. Professional editing would enhance the overall quality of the manuscript and ensure it meets the standards for scholarly communication. |  |
| Optional/General comments | The manuscript would benefit from a more explicit organizational structure with clearer section headings and subheadings to guide the reader. Additionally, the inclusion of a case study or practical examples specifically from police leadership contexts would strengthen the manuscript's relevance to the book's focus. The conclusion section should be expanded to more clearly articulate practical implications and recommendations for leadership development in law enforcement settings. Finally, visual elements such as tables or figures summarizing the different types of toxic leadership behaviors would enhance the manuscript's clarity and impact. |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **PART 2:** | | |
|  | Reviewer’s comment | Author’s comment *(if agreed with the reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?** | *(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in detail)*  . |  |

**Reviewers:**

**Halek Mu’min, Indonesia**