|  |
| --- |
|  |
| Book Name: | [**Geography, Earth Science and Environment: Research Highlights**](https://www.bookpi.org/bookstore/product/geography-earth-science-and-environment-research-highlights-vol-1/) |
| Manuscript Number: | **Ms\_BPR\_5296** |
| Title of the Manuscript:  | **Ecological Changes over a Century in the Western Coastal Area of Jakarta Bay: Based on a Short Core Sample** |
| Type of the Article | **BOOK CHAPTER** |

**Special note:**

**A research paper already published in a journal can be published as a Book Chapter in an expanded form with proper copyright approval.**

**Source Article:**

**This chapter is an extended version of the article published by the same author(s) in the following journal.**

**AIP Conf. Proc. 2026, 020019 (2018).**

[**https://doi.org/10.1063/1.5064979**](https://doi.org/10.1063/1.5064979)

|  |
| --- |
| PART 1: Comments |
|  | Reviewer’s comment**Artificial Intelligence (AI) generated or assisted review comments are strictly prohibited during peer review.** | Author’s Feedback *(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.** | **This manuscript provides valuable insights into long-term ecological changes in Jakarta Bay, a region increasingly influenced by anthropogenic pressures. By utilizing the Ammonia-Elphidium (A-E) index alongside heavy metal concentrations in sediment cores, the study reconstructs over a century of environmental history, highlighting critical periods of hypoxia and pollution. The findings not only contribute to regional environmental monitoring but also serve as a model for similar coastal systems experiencing eutrophication and contamination. This interdisciplinary approach combining micropaleontology, geochemistry, and environmental science is especially significant for assessing historical baselines and guiding future conservation strategies.** |  |
| **Is the title of the article suitable?****(If not please suggest an alternative title)** |  |  |
| Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here. | **The abstract outlines the major components of the study but could be improved for clarity and completeness. Please mention upfront that the study investigates historical ecological changes through the A-E index and metal concentration analysis. Some sentences are awkwardly constructed or repetitive. For example, "Hypoxia in aquatic leads to a double impact" could be rephrased as "Aquatic hypoxia has a dual impact: reducing oxygen availability for biotic respiration and increasing metal toxicity."****The purpose of the study should be stated more explicitly in the first few lines. Currently, the abstract starts with background information on hypoxia, which could be condensed. The final sentence should emphasize the significance of the findings and their potential environmental or management implications.** |  |
| **Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.**  | **The manuscript appears scientifically sound and methodologically appropriate. The use of the A-E index and 210Pb dating is a well-established approach in paleoenvironmental reconstruction. The link between hypoxia, heavy metal accumulation, and anthropogenic activity is reasonably discussed, and the interpretation aligns with the presented data****Addition****Clearer explanation of the statistical or quantitative analysis (if any was done) to support the trends.****More contextual comparison with similar studies in other regions to strengthen the broader scientific relevance.** |  |
| **Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.** | **No Need** |  |
| Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications? | The manuscript requires moderate to substantial editing for scholarly English. Grammar errors and inconsistent tense usage. |  |
| Optional/General comments |  |  |

|  |
| --- |
| **PART 2:**  |
|  | Reviewer’s comment | Author’s comment *(if agreed with the reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?**  | *(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in detail)* |  |

**Reviewer details:**

**Partha Sarathy Palanivel, Annamalai University, India**