|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  | |
| Book Name: | [**Agricultural Sciences: Techniques and Innovations**](https://bookstore.bookpi.org/product/agricultural-sciences-techniques-and-innovations-vol-1/) |
| Manuscript Number: | **Ms\_BPR\_6313** |
| Title of the Manuscript: | **Weed management in aerobic rice cultivation in South Gujarat, India** |
| Type of the Article | **Book Chapter** |

**Special note:**

**A research paper already published in a journal can be published as a Book Chapter in an expanded form with proper copyright approval.**

**Source Article:**

**This chapter is an extended version of the article published by the same author(s) in the following journal.**

**Journal of Experimental Agriculture International, 47(8): 66-72, 2025.**

**DOI: 10.9734/jeai/2025/v47i83648**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| PART 1: Comments | | |
|  | Reviewer’s comment **Artificial Intelligence (AI) generated or assisted review comments are strictly prohibited during peer review.** | Author’s Feedback *(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.** | The work has valuable lessons on how weeds can be managed sustainably in aerobic rice production, demonstrating that mechanical weeding is a potential, eco-friendly alternative to herbicides with the capacity to improve yield while reducing environmental impacts. Its findings are of utmost significance for scientists and agronomists who require solutions that are scalable enough to address water availability, labor constraints, and sustainable food production in resource-limited systems. |  |
| **Is the title of the article suitable?**  **(If not please suggest an alternative title)** | Yes, the title **"Weed management in aerobic rice cultivation in South Gujarat, India"** is **suitable and effective**. I recommended the following title **Evaluating Mechanical Weeding as a Sustainable Technique for Weed Management in Aerobic Rice Systems of South Gujarat"** |  |
| Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here. | The abstract is **good but not fully comprehensive**. It effectively summarizes the key findings but misses an opportunity to provide a more complete picture of the study's context and significance. |  |
| **Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.** | Yes, based on the content provided, the manuscript appears to be **scientifically correct** |  |
| **Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.**  **-** | **Yes, the references are largely sufficient.** The list includes several recent works (2020, 2023, 2024), which is excellent |  |
| Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications? | **Yes, the language is generally suitable for scholarly communication** |  |
| Optional/General comments | This manuscript presents research with significant practical applications. It is scientifically sound and ready for submission. Implementing these optional suggestions would not correct errors but would **elevate the paper from a results to a more impactful and comprehensive resource** for the scientific and farming community, potentially increasing its chances of publication in a higher-impact journal. |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **PART 2:** | | |
|  | Reviewer’s comment | Author’s comment *(if agreed with the reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?** | *(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in detail)* |  |

**Reviewer details:**

**Daniel Abebe, Ethiopia**